

Annual Assessment Report

Program Assessment of Key Performance Indicators of Student Outcomes

The M.A. Counseling Program, Specialty Area Clinical Mental Health Counseling, assessed program student learning through 10 Key Performance Indicators (KPIs). Each KPI is assessed multiple times throughout the program. The KPI data below includes Student Exit Survey, Employer Survey, Site Supervisor Survey and final KPI assignment in the program. The final KPI assignment in the program, Student Exit Survey, and Site Supervisor Survey were completed upon student graduation (May 2023). The Employer Survey includes employers of graduates from the prior three years (Summer 2023).

Program Outcome Data Result Averages

Likert Scale for KPIs – Student Exit Survey, Site Supervisor Survey, and Employer Survey
(5=Very Satisfied; 4=Satisfied; 3=Neither satisfied nor unsatisfied; 2=Unsatisfied; 1=Very Unsatisfied)

Likert scale for Program Dispositions-Student Self-Assessment; Site Supervisor; Faculty Supervisor
(5=Exceeds Expectations; 4=Meets Expectations; 3=Near Expectations; 2=Below Expectations; 1=Harmful)

Key Performance Indicators	ASSESSMENT SOURCE & CRITERIA (measures Program KPIs)	PROGRAM RESULTS
II.F.1.k. Understand and apply strategies for personal and professional	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Met Standard
	Student Exit Survey: Q1	Student Survey 4.5
self-evaluation and	Employer Survey: Q4	Employer Survey: 4.6
implications for practice.	Site Supervisor Survey: Q1	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.4
	100% of students will receive 20 or higher points out of 25 points on the Professional self-evaluation and implications for practice sections in the Clinical Transcription and Self-Evaluation Project.	100% of students fully met or exceeded expectations.
	100% of students will Fully Meet or Exceed Expectations for the Professional self-evaluation and implications for practice section in the Self Evaluation Paper.	100% of students fully met or exceeded expectations.
II.F.2.c. Understand and apply multicultural counseling competencies.	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Partially Met Standard
	Student Exit Survey: Q3	Student Survey: 4.3

	Employer Survey: Q6	Employer Survey: 4.3
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q3	Site Supervisor Survey: 3.9
	100% of students will meet or exceed expectations on the Client System Description and Multicultural Counseling Considerations sections (4 points out of 6 points) of the final case presentation.	100% of students fully met or exceeded expectations.
II.F.2.g. Understand and consider the impact of	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Partially Met Standard
spiritual beliefs on clients' and	Student Exit Survey: Q4	Student Survey: 4.6
counselors'	Employer Survey: Q4	Employer Survey: 4.5
worldviews	Site Supervisor Survey: Q4	Site Supervisor Survey: 3.7
	100% of students will meet or exceed expectations on Impact of spiritual beliefs on clients' and counselors' worldviews section of the Self Evaluation Paper.	100% fully met expectations.
	100% of students will meet or exceed expectations on the Multicultural Counseling Considerations section of the case presentations.	100% fully met expectations.
II.F.3.f. Understand the importance of systemic and environmental factors	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Partially Met Standard
that affect human development,	Student Exit Survey: Q5	Student Survey: 4.5
functioning, and	Employer Survey: Q5	Employer Survey: 4.4
behavior	Site Supervisor Survey: Q5	Site Supervisor Survey: 3.8
	100% of students will meet or exceed expectations on the Understand the importance of systemic and environmental factors that affect human development, functioning, and behavior section of the case presentations.	100% of students met expectations.
II.F.4.b. Understand and implement approaches for conceptualizing the interrelationships among and between work, mental well-being, relationships, and other life roles and factors.	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Met Standard
	Student Exit Survey: Q6	Student Survey: 4.7
	Employer Survey: Q6	Employer Survey: 4.5
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q6	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.2
	100% of students will meet or exceed expectations on the Understand and implement approaches for conceptualizing the interrelationships among and between work, mental well-being, relationships, and other life roles and factors section of the case presentations	100% of students met expectations.

II.F.5.g. Understand and	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Met Standard
demonstrate essential	Student Exit Survey: Q8	Student Survey: 4.4
interviewing, counseling, and case	Employer Survey: Q8	Employer Survey: 4.7
conceptualization skills.	Site Supervisor Survey: Q8	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.3
	100% of students will receive 16 or higher points out of 20 on the 2 Essential Counseling and Case Conceptualization Skills sections of the Theoretical Project Presentation.	100% of students met expectations.
II.F.6.b. Understand and apply	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Met Standard
the dynamics associated with group	Student Exit Survey: Q7	Student Survey: 4.3
process and	Employer Survey: Q7	Employer Survey: 4.5
development.	Site Supervisor Survey: Q7	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.1
	100% of students will meet or exceed expectations for the Group Process Dynamics; Beneficial Group Dynamics; and Changing Group Dynamics for the 5th and final reflection of the Reflection of Group Counseling Experience in Community Setting.	100% of students met expectations.
II.F.7.e. Understand and	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Met Standard
demonstrate use of assessments for	Student Exit Survey: Q9	Student Survey: 4.3
diagnostic and	Employer Survey: Q9	Employer Survey: 4.5
intervention planning purposes.	Site Supervisor Survey: Q9	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.2
	100% of students will receive 20 or higher points out of 25 on the Comprehensive Evaluation: Assessment and Diagnosis section of the Trauma Case Application Final Paper.	100% of students fully met or exceeded expectations.
II.F.8.b. Identify and apply	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Met Standard
evidence- based counseling practices.	Student Exit Survey: Q10	Student Survey: 4.4
souriseinig praetices.	Employer Survey: Q10	Employer Survey: 4.4
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q10	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.3
	100% of students will receive a 20 out of 25 on the Treatment Plan with Specific Interventions and Resources section of the Trauma Case Application Final Paper.	100% of students fully met or exceeded expectations.
5.C.1.b. Understand and apply	Average score of 4 or above on associated question identifies meets/exceeds standard.	Partially Met Standard
theories and models related to clinical	Student Exit Survey: Q11	Student Survey: 4.3
	Employer Survey: Q11	Employer Survey: 4.6

mental health counseling.	ISita Sunarvisor Survay: 011	Site Supervisor Survey: 3.8
	100 /0 01 01aao1110 11m 1000110 10 01 1mg.101 pointe oat 01 00	100% of students met expectations.

Program Outcome	ASSESSMENT SOURCE & CRITERIA (measures Program Outcomes)	PROGRAM RESULTS
Develop a professional identity as a Clinical Mental Health Counselor within the broader counseling profession.	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
	Student Survey: Q12	Student Survey:4.5
	Employer Survey: Q12	Employer Survey: 4.2
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q12	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.3
2. Demonstrate proficiency in the counseling core curriculum and specialty area of Clinical Mental Health Counseling.	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
	Student Survey: Q13	Student Survey: 4.4
	Employer Survey: Q13	Employer Survey: 4.5
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q13	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.3
3. Apply research to the evaluation and practice of effective counseling.	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
	Student Survey: Q14	Student Survey: 4.2
	Employer Survey: Q14	Employer Survey: 4.3
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q14	Site Supervisor Survey: 4
4. Apply ethical principles and ethical decision-making to counseling practice.	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
	Student Survey: Q15	Student Survey: 4.4
	Employer Survey: Q15	Employer Survey: 4.8
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q15	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.5
5. Apply cultural sensitivity and social justice advocacy in research, assessment, and practice.	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Partially Met Standard
	Student Survey: Q16	Student Survey: 4.3
	Employer Survey: Q16	Employer Survey: 4.6
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q16	Site Supervisor Survey: 3.9
6. Develop sensitivity to religious and spiritual diversity	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard

throughout the counseling process.		
	Student Survey: Q17	Student Survey: 4.4
	Employer Survey: Q17	Employer Survey: 4.7
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q17	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.2
7. Demonstrate professional counseling competencies in a mental health clinical setting.	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
	Student Survey: Q18	Student Survey: 4.6
	Employer Survey: Q18	Employer Survey: 4.5
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q18	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.2
Overall, how satisfied are you with your interns' education from Bethel's M.A. Counseling Program?	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
	Student Survey: Q19	Student Survey: 4.6
	Employer Survey: Q19	Employer Survey: 4.7
	Site Supervisor Survey: Q19	Site Supervisor Survey: 4.3
Professional Counseling		
Dispositions Used with Permission: Counselor Competencies Scale – Revised (CCS-R) – Part 2 Counseling Dispositions and Behavior (Lambie, Mullen, Swank, & Blount, 2015)	ASSESSMENT SOURCE & CRITERIA (measures Program Dispositions)	PROGRAM RESULTS
Professional Ethics	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Adheres to the ethical guidelines of the ACA, ASCA, IAMFC, APA, & NBCC; including practices within competencies.	Student Self-Assessment: 2. A	Student Self-Assessment: 4.3
	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. A	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.3
	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2.A	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.3
Professional Behavior	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Behaves in a professional manner towards supervisors, peers, & clients (e.g., emotional regulation). Is respectful and appreciative to the culture of colleagues and is able to effectively collaborate with others.	Student Self-Assessment: 2. B	Student Self-Assessment: 4.7
	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. B	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.7
	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. B	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.6
Professional and Personal Boundaries	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard

Maintains appropriate boundaries with supervisors,	Student Self-Assessment: 2.C	Student Self-Assessment: 4.5
peers, & clients.	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2.C	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.5
	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2.C	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.3
Knowledge & Adherence to Site and Course Policies	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Demonstrates an understanding	Student Self-Assessment: 2. D	Student Self-Assessment: 4.7
& appreciation for all counseling site and course policies & procedures.	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. D	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.8
F	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. D	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.7
Record Keeping & Task Completion	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Completes all weekly record	Student Self-Assessment: 2. E	Student Self-Assessment: 4.4
keeping & tasks correctly & promptly (e.g., case notes, psychosocial reports, treatment	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. E	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.7
plans, supervisory report).	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. E	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.7
Multicultural Competence in Counseling Relationship	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
	Student Self-Assessment: 2. F	Student Self-Assessment: 4
Demonstrates respect for culture (e.g., race, ethnicity, gender, spirituality, religion,	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. F	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.2
sexual orientation, disability, social class, etc.) and awareness of and responsiveness to ways in which culture interacts with the counseling relationship.	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. F	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4
Emotional Stability and Self-Control	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Demonstrates self-awareness	Student Self-Assessment: 2. G	Student Self-Assessment: 4.3
and emotional stability (i.e., congruence between mood & affect) & self-control (i.e., impulse control) in relationships with clients.	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. G	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.8
	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. G	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.3
Motivated to Learn & Grow / Initiative	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Demonstrates engagement in learning & development of his or	Student Self-Assessment: 2.H	Student Self-Assessment: 4.6
her counseling competencies.	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2.H	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.5

	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2.H	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.6
Openness to Feedback	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Responds non-defensively & alters behavior in accordance with supervisory &/or instructor feedback.	Student Self-Assessment: 2. I	Student Self-Assessment: 4.7
	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. I	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 5
	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. I	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.7
Flexibility and Adaptability	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Demonstrates ability to adapt to changing circumstances,	Student Self-Assessment: 2. J	Student Self-Assessment: 4.2
unexpected events, & new situations.	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. J	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.6
	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. J	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.2
Congruence & Genuineness	Average score of 4 or above on associated question.	Met Standard
Demonstrates ability to be present and 'be true to oneself'	Student Self-Assessment: 2. K	Student Self-Assessment: 4.4
	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. K	Site Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.7
	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 2. K	Faculty Supervisor Final Evaluation: 4.4

Program Proposed Changes and Implemented Changes based on Assessment Data Review

The M.A. Counseling program faculty reviewed the data from three cohorts graduating in the Spring 2021, Spring 2022, and Spring 2023. These cohorts represent the most recent three graduating classes. The program faculty also met with the Advisory Council in October 2022 and May 2023 to elicit feedback that was helpful in considering proposed changes. The Advisory Council includes current students, alumni, adjunct faculty, site supervisors, and employers. The following are changes that were in process for the prior Annual Assessment Report and have already been implemented, as well as proposed changes for 2023-2024.

It is important to note that all standards were met in relation to our Key Performance Indicator measures, with 100% of students fully meeting or exceeding the standards measured. Additionally, all student self-assessments and surveys, faculty supervisor final evaluations, and employer surveys met or exceeded each of the standards being measured. All professional counseling dispositions met or exceeded expectations for each of the standards being measured. With Placement site supervisor surveys, 24 of the 29 standards met or exceeded the standards. Exceptions included four relating to Key Performance Indicators and one relating to Program Outcomes. The five standards that were below the average score of four will each be addressed individually below. These scores were at the high end of the "near expectations" rating at between 3.7 and 3.9. It is important to note that we only received twelve surveys returned by site supervisors and that this survey data related to the 2023 graduating cohort specifically. The timing of when we get feedback from the site supervisors regarding the students is thus

delayed in relation to when we specifically cover key performance indicators in classwork, which will be discussed below.

Proposed and Implemented Changes:

- **Survey Change.** In future surveys, we want to set up a text box to gather qualitative responses, which will be required for any response that is 3.9 or below for any survey item. Given the language that a score of 3 is "neither satisfied nor unsatisfied," having specific details related to any response within this range or lower would be helpful. Having specific feedback would allow us to understand the rating and better enable us to make appropriate improvements in the future.
- II.F.2.c. Understand and apply multicultural counseling competencies. This standard was partially met, due to the Site Supervisors' average score of 3.9. Contextually, the graduating class of 2023 were in their Multicultural Counseling and Social Justice course during the Spring of 2021. This was a time of ongoing turmoil in the Minneapolis/St. Paul area. The multiple shared stressors, including being less than one-year from George Floyd's death, struggling with contentious race relations within the area, while continuing to be 6 feet apart and masked (and at times online) due to COVID-19 added significant challenges to students being able to fully engage within the course. Additionally, the shooting of Dante Wright occurred locally during the third week of class.
 - After the course was offered in Spring 2021, we implemented a number of changes to the course. First, the course is now taught by a core faculty member. The three core faculty members reviewed and revised the course for 2022, adding immersion experiences within the course. Additionally, a large focus on cultural humility was implemented. A <u>Lambers Fisher</u> training on multicultural awareness and competence has been implemented into the class. Students are also now focused on skills related to multicultural and social justice counseling, including practice with broaching. For Spring 2023, clips from <u>Treating Racial Trauma: Strategies for Working with the Wounds of Racism</u> (used with permission) were implemented as an additional training tool in the course. Further, a <u>Poverty Simulation</u> was added in Fall 2021. This had not been part of the 2023 graduating cohort's training, which is now an important way we begin to weave a multicultural perspective throughout the program, beginning in the first semester.
 - For Spring 2024, a panel of alumni will be invited to share with the class specifically about their experiences applying multicultural counseling competencies. We will continue to evaluate and consider this course on a yearly basis for continual improvement.
- II.F.2.g. Understand and consider the impact of spiritual beliefs on clients' and counselors' worldviews. This standard was partially met, due to the Placement Site Supervisors' average score of 3.7. Contextually, the graduating class of 2023 were in their Worldview and Integration of Religion and Spirituality in Counseling course also during the Spring of 2021, with many of the same factors impacting the ability to fully engage with this course. Having effective practice time/role plays to help students apply what they were learning was impacted by challenges of COVID-19 protocols.
 - Since the 2021 offering of the course, additional focus on considering the counselor's worldview in relation to their view of social justice has been brought into both the Foundations of Clinical Mental Health Counseling course as well as the Worldview and Integration of Religion and Spirituality in Counseling course. Times of application/practice have been specifically woven into the course to assist with students understanding the impact of client and counselor spiritual beliefs and worldview in clinical practice. Additionally, faculty have added specifics within case presentations during practicum/internships for addressing the client's spiritual/religious/worldview of the client..

- Faculty will implement additional guidance for case presentations in practicum/internships to clearly remind the students to look at their own worldview/spirituality/religion and the impact on their clients.
- II.F.3.f. Understand the importance of systemic and environmental factors that affect human development, functioning, and behavior. This standard was partially met, due to the Site Supervisors' average score of 3.8. The graduating class of 2023 were in their Lifespan Development course during the Summer of 2021.
 - Content for Lifespan Development is being revised for Summer 2024, with an intentional focus on systemic and environmental factors. Additionally, core faculty will intentionally offer students more information on resources available for clients to help them deepen their understanding of systemic and environmental factors. The intentional inclusion of the Poverty Simulation is seen as a start to this process, during which we have already begun to share resources with students during their first 8 weeks of the program. A resource section for the Program Moodle site will be expanded to provide additional information for students on a variety of topics.
- **5.C.1.b.** Understand and apply theories and models related to clinical mental health counseling. This standard was partially met, due to the Site Supervisors' average score of 3.8. The graduating class of 2023 completed their Theories and Techniques of Counseling course during the Fall of 2021.
 - For Fall 2022, an updated textbook was chosen to provide additional clarity on theories specifically applicable to clinical mental health counseling. Additionally, key theories such as Cognitive Behavioral Therapy (CBT), Acceptance and Commitment Therapy (ACT), and Dialectical Behavioral Therapy (DBT) are focused on in the course with attention given to theory-specific case conceptualization, treatment planning, and interventions. The course was revised to include a cumulative classroom exercise in which students apply a variety of assigned theories to the same case followed by discussion regarding the strengths and weaknesses of each theoretical perspective.
 - For students in their clinical work, the case presentations for practicum/internships were revised for Summer 2022 to add a section related to evidence-based practice.
 - For 2023-2024, additional advanced training on theories (CBT, ACT, DBT) will be purchased to
 provide additional ways for students to develop their learning and application of the theories
 while working directly with clients. They will have the opportunity to use these trainings as
 nondirect hours during their clinical year.
- Program Outcome 5. Apply cultural sensitivity and social justice advocacy in research, assessment, and practice. This standard was partially met, due to the Site Supervisors' average score of 3.9. This program outcome is woven through a number of courses including: Foundations of Clinical Mental Health Counseling, which the graduating class of 2023 took Fall 2020; Worldview and Integration of Religion and Spirituality in Counseling (Spring of 2021); Multicultural Counseling and Social Justice course (Spring of 2021). In addition to the related points discussed above:
 - Faculty will continue to intentionally weave themes of advocacy into courses by highlighting tools provided by the American Counseling Association (e.g. the 2020 Advocacy Competencies model and the ACA "Take Action" page). Intentional use of these resources will solidify students' professional identity and expand their attention to the multiple levels of advocacy which are necessary to give clients what they need to succeed. Additionally, core faculty will emphasize breaking down sociocultural barriers and advocacy opportunities as interns present cases in practicum/internship. New emphases on cultural humility, cultural sensitivity, and broaching skills have been integrated into the Multicultural Counseling and Social Justice course.
- Additional Program Changes:

- Admissions requirements were revised in Fall 2022, based on considerations to reduce barriers in our admissions process in hopes to increase diversity within our applicants. Changes included removing the GRE/MAT expectation and revising our prerequisite expectations. The requirements have now been fully implemented for the 2023-2024 admissions cycle.
- Faculty reviewed expanded data on stages in the admission process to further determine ways to reduce barriers in the admissions process. Additionally, a fact-sheet displaying cost-by-semester (including textbooks costs) was finalized Fall 2022 for the admissions department to share with potential applicants to give transparent information on the cost of the program. This document will be revised on an annual basis.
- Professional development opportunities were added to key courses in 2022-2023 to expand student learning through specific trainings including Telehealth Ethics and Best Practices, Multicultural Awareness and Diversity, and TelePlay Therapy.
- Professional Orientation and Ethics was reviewed and revised for Spring 2023, including implementation of telehealth considerations, as well as further development of professional identity for the students as clinical mental health counselors.
- Clinical Assessment and Intervention was reviewed and revised for Spring 2023.
- Theories and Techniques of Group Counseling was reviewed and revised for Spring 2023...
- Revised CEU training expectation in Practicum and Internship courses starting the Summer of 2023, with all students to complete ACA training in each semester.
- Artificial Intelligence (AI) policy included in the 2023 Student Handbook.
- Lifespan Development is under review and revision for Summer 2024.
- Counseling Microskills is under review and revision for Fall 2024.
- CACREP Celebration, with free CEU event for alumni and current students planned for November 10, 2023.
- o Fall 2023, we began implementation of a program LinkedIn page for students and alumni.